



**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE**  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
National Marine Sanctuary System  
Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary  
175 Edward Foster Rd.  
Scituate, MA 02055  
(781) 545-8026 FAX: (781) 545-8036

**5th SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING**  
The Town Hall, Gloucester  
16 December 2002

**PRESENT**

William Adler		
William Amaru		
Regina Asmutis-Silvia	(Alternate to Susan Farady)	
Peter Borelli		
Pricilla Brooks		
Gib Chase	(Alternate to Pricilla Brooks)	
Peter Davidoff	(Alternate to Jackson Kent, III)	
Paul Diodati		(Ex-Officio Member)
William Eldridge	(Alternate to Frederick Noland, III)	
Susan Farady		
Jerry Hill		
Lt. Cmndr . Greg Hitchen	(Designee for Rear Admiral S. Crea)	
Donald Hourihan	(Alternate to John Williamson)	
Paul Howard		(Ex-Officio Member)
Roger Jarvis	(Alternate to Barry Gibson)	
Jackson Kent, III		
David Pierce	(Designee for Paul Diodati)	(Ex-Officio Member)
Rob Robertson	(Alternate to Sally Yozell)	
Kathi Rodriguez	(Designee for Patricia Turkil)	(Ex-Officio Member)
Thomas Skinner		(Ex-Officio Member)
David Slocum	(Alternate to Jerry Hill)	
Mason Weinrich		
Sally Yozell		

**SBNMS STAFF**

Craig MacDonald, Superintendent	Ben Haskell
Kate VanDine	Nathalie Ward

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Gus Forte	Robin Perrtree
Tony Verga	Stepahinie Marshall
Mason Smith	John Crawford
Kate Sardi	Sue Rocca
Cara Kekaak	Senator Todd
Stephanie Szelrlag	Brad Barr
Kaori Mine	Danielle Luttenberg

## **I. Welcome and Approval of Minutes (Bill Amaru)**

- Minutes of 4<sup>th</sup> SAC approved
- Minutes of 2<sup>nd</sup> SAC/ deferred to next SAC meeting
- Revised Agenda schedule: Orientation to Issues and Preparation for Voting to follow Scoping Results

## **II. Program Report (Craig MacDonald)**

- Reported on emergency dollars for pier repair
- Congress: 21<sup>st</sup> January
- Introduced Brad Barr (Regional Coordinator for East Coast and Gulf of Mexico)
- FOIA: discussed nature of application for SAC and Ex-Officio Members

## **III. Overview of MPR Process (Ed Lindelof)**

- Lindelof, Coordinator of the National Management Plan Review, familiarized Members with *SBNMS SAC Meeting Packet* (See Document)
- Discussed the timeline of MPR process for SBNMS and provided example of “*Channel Islands NMS/DMP*” with specific attention to ISSUE: Cultural and Historic Resources and subissues (See Document pp. 64-68);
- Discussed the NMS Process for identifying and prioritizing issues, highlighting next steps in the process by example of *Joint Management Plan Review (JMPR) Cordell Bank, Gulf of Farallones & Monterey Bay NMS Priority Issue Work Plan* (See Document pp. 2); and,
- Fielded questions and emphasized that the MP Action Plan was “issue” driven by the constituents.

## **IV. Scoping Results (Craig MacDonald)**

MacDonald reported on the following SAC documents:

- The total *Count and Status of Scoping Meetings* (see Documents) in Mystic, CT; Plymouth, Provincetown, New Bedford, Falmouth, Boston and Gloucester, MA; Portland, ME; and Portsmouth, NH. (2661 written comments and 17,000 petitions from the Plymouth Marine Mammal Research Center (PMMRC);
- The timeline: SBNMS Process for Prioritizing Scoping Issues describes the proposed timeline for the scoping and prioritization process, including “process” and “products” (October 2002-April 2003).

### **Concerns**

*Q. To what extent do voting members discuss with constituents issues before “prioritization voting” on January 10<sup>th</sup> (later moved to January 15<sup>th</sup>).*

A. Need to discuss with alternate.

MacDonald discussed and answered questions concerning the following documents:

1) SBNMS *Summary of Scoping Comments Management Plan Review (SSC/MPR)* is a 56-page compilation of “factoids” extracted from letters and public comments during the Scoping Process. The staff divided detailed comments into eight topics and subissues noting specific concerns, and actions/strategies. The last subsection, General Guidance is rhetorical questions from the public comments.

2) Draft *Summary Scoping Document (DSSD)* was emailed to all SAC Members. This seven-page document is a staff synthesis derived from the *SSC/MPR*. and,

3) The *Summary of Scoping Comments (SSC)* is a two page abbreviated outline of the topics and subissues.

### **Questions**

*Q. Does the Summary Scoping document accurately reflect the number of times comments were received about a particular issue?*

A. The process is not intended to “add up” constituent interest, rather it is simply noting concern.

*Q. What are we prioritizing— issues 1-8 and then their sub-issues?*

A. Each issue is one vote.

Q. How does one view the detailed comments?

A. Scoping Comments CD will be prepared for SAC Members. Requested by David Pierce, Jerry Hill, Mason Weinrich, Pricilla Brooks, Paul Howard, Regina Asmutis-Silvia, Sally Farady and Don Hourihan)

## I. WORKING LUNCH

### V. Orientation to Issues and Preparation for Voting (Craig MacDonald)

MacDonald described each major topic and subissue, and opened the meeting to comments from Members.

#### **A. Draft Scoping Summary Document (DSSD): Questions**

Sally Yozell noted that it is important to: a) reword issues in DSSD to align with prioritization worksheet and summary outline; b) insert words in Summary of Scoping and Prioritization Worksheet (1A “Alteration of Sanctuary Habitat...” is presented as a “problem statement”; instead, insert: “Address alteration of Sanctuary...”

Q. Is there a difference between “What is an issue?” and “What information is needed by the public?”

A.

Q. Some topics are too broad for accurate definition (e.g. Issue 1: What is the meaning of “ecosystem protection”?). Is the public concerned with the issue or strategy?

A. Topic One is concerned with a holistic approach.

*Q. Can one lump or delete issues?*

A. It is up to the SAC how the issues are best represented. For example, one could lump 2F (2 Impacts of Human Activities on Marine Mammals: 2F Better Coordination with Other Regional Marine Mammal Protection Authorities) with 8B (8: Sanctuary Authority and Cross Jurisdictional Interaction: 8B Inter Agency Coordination and Effectiveness).

Q. In the prioritization process, how will our votes turn into issues that SACs working groups address?

A. SAC Members must be concerned with the priority issues for the next five years.

#### **B. Concerns—the DSSD**

- It is too brief; the synopsis does not always reflect the larger document. Are scoping comments of four years ago also included?
- Must separate issues from prioritization or concerns.
- Must address issues not recommendations.
- The DSSD does not accurately reflect the comments of the fishing industry. It is important that SBNMS does not portray the view that “the fishermen do not want to be restricted”— this statement will put “the industry’s on the defensive and start the process on the wrong key.”

- The document does not reflect the public's comment concerning, What is the vision of the Sanctuary?

*MacDonald requests that any deletions or inclusions to DSSS be submitted to him in writing immediately.*

### **C. Prioritization of Issues**

*MacDonald continued to explain the voting process and Worksheet: Prioritization of Issues. MacDonald and Lindehof note SACs suggestions for revising the text (e.g. "site benefits" changed to "site impacts") and offered to look into putting the information on the web site and email revised worksheet to SAC Members.*

*A discussion of upcoming Working Groups followed, emphasizing the necessity for many meetings before the summer.*

## **VI. Public Comment**

- *Danielle Luttenberg (Environmental Defense Fund) ...*
- *Dan Hourihan advocated the need to preserve the fishing industry.*
- *Jerry Hill reiterated the perception of the SBNMS as a "bell-weller"— how we look at the future.*

## **VII. Other Council Business**

### **A. Submerged Cultural Resources (SCR) (Ben Haskell)**

Haskell noted that the Sanctuary is an incredible repository of SCR and presented an update on shipwrecks discovered this summer, the *Louise Cray* and the *Frank Palmer*. Concern noted that it is important not to glorify vessel if lives have been lost.

### **B. Fish Waste Disposal Proposal (Ben Haskell)**

Haskell reported that the EPA is considering a proposal by the TransPacific International Company to create a Fish Processing Plant that would dump up to 40.5 million metric tons of mackerel and herring gurry and 2.3 million gallons of wastewater annually, 4 miles outside the Sanctuary (by Gloucester). EPA may consider an Ocean Dumping Act (ODA) permit or simply a permit. Haskell will give an update at the next SAC meeting.

### **C. Fiber Optic Cable**

The 360 Atlantic Company (Canadian) has defaulted and subsequently filed bankruptcy. Their agreement was to give \$300,000 to monitor the cable on SBNMS. A small stretch of cable (10-20 feet) is exposed on SBNMS. Members advise that actual coordinates be given to prevent any mishaps.

### **D. Motions and Votes by SAC Members**

Sally Yozell put forth the following motions that were unanimously supported by SAC Members:

- SAC Meeting materials needed in timely manner (one week prior) to SAC meetings
- Executive Committee will assist Craig MacDonald with developing SAC Agenda. Every effort will be made to have Agenda prepared two weeks prior to SAC meeting
- Preliminary voting for Prioritization of Issues in preparation for Working Groups will be January 21, 2003.
- Next SAC meeting will be no earlier than 2 weeks after 21<sup>st</sup> January 2003 scheduled meeting. Nathalie Ward will query Members as to best three dates during (the second week of) February.

## **VIII. Adjourn**

**January 10, 2003**

- *Summary Scoping comments*
- *6th SAC Feb. Mtg. Date*
- *Summary Scoping Comments Returned for Revision by staff*
- *Instructions for Prioritization Worksheet sent by 10<sup>th</sup>/RETURN 24<sup>th</sup>*
- *CD Available*

**SAC CHAIRS Meeting**

- *ADLER's Case Study (Fishing) Discuss*
- *Adler's flight and hotel reservations*
- *Case Study/topics*
- *SAC Description Additions*
- *Jan. 17: Top-five worksheet from each Chair*
- *January 31: Case Study Templates due*
- *Annual Report*

**Questions/TO Dos**

- *Put Craig on List Serve*
  - *CHOOSE Meeting Date*
  - *Facilitator: Brady?*
  - *Should Borelli get an Alternate*
  - *Update SAC Members list with addresses*
  - *SAC Mtg. Check List*
  - *Executive Meeting to pull together Agenda 21/22/03*
1. *Approval of 2<sup>nd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> SAC Minutes*
  2. *Election of Officers*
  3. *Borelli Alternate*